

9th March 2023 / Issue #15 Time to read: 8 minutes

The Road Ahead is a series of short comments on investment strategy by Henry Neville.

I keep six honest serving-men
(They taught me all I knew);
Their names are What and Why and When
And How and Where and Who.
I send them over land and sea,
I send them east and west;
But after they have worked for me,
I give them all a rest.

But different folk have different views;

I know a person small—

She keeps ten million serving-men,

Who get no rest at all.

She sends 'em abroad on her own affairs,

From the second she opens her eyes—

One million Hows, two million Wheres,

And seven million Whys!

- Rudyard Kipling, "The Elephant's Child" (1900)

Introduction

Questions are at the heart of investment management. Yet few investors have capacity to ask more than a handful of differentiated market questions each day, let alone answer them. Those who claim to do more are probably lying. But perhaps the god is about to come out of the machine and, per the analogue of Kipling's poem, we are on the cusp of being able to unleash question-armies of millions onto our investment landscapes.

It is within this context that we recently turned our attention to what ChatGPT 'thinks' about investment strategy. Broadly speaking, our investment framework involves two stages. First, to ascertain which inflation episode we are in within our Fire & Ice framework (Fire, disinflation, Ice or reflation). And second, within the allowable ranges of each of the four episodes, to determine what our asset allocation should be based on three lenses: valuation, growth and sentiment.

We thought we'd get ChatGPT to give us a hand with the latter stage of this process. For the sake of simplicity, we limit our line of enquiry to US equities. Via a series of

prompts, we push our Al interlocutor for a single favourite metric that encapsulates each of our three lenses. Below we give a summary of ChatGPT's views on each. We then overlay the machine's view with our own experience of appropriate transformations and lookbacks, and backtest its efficacy.

Valuation

ChatGPT: "If I had to choose only one [valuation metric], I would choose the forward price-to-earning ('P/E') ratio. The forward P/E ratio is based on the market's expectations for the company's future earnings performance, which is arguably more relevant than its past performance. As a general rule of thumb, a lower forward P/E ratio would indicate that a stock is relatively cheaper and potentially more attractive from a valuation perspective...[and vice versa]."

In Figure 1, we show the results of making buy and sell decisions for the S&P 500 Index (relative to US Treasuries) based on the level of the 12-month forward P/E multiple. The top panel shows the forward multiple for the S&P 500 with +/- 1.5 standard deviation ('SD') bands. The middle panel shows the signals generated if you were to sell equities when the P/E breached +1.5 SDs and vice versa. The bottom panel shows the performance results of a 50/50 equity/bond portfolio (blue) versus one which is 100% equities when the signal is 'buy', 100% bonds when it is 'sell' and 50/50 otherwise.

The bottom line needs little explanation. It doesn't work. At best you could say it's very early. In the DotCom bubble, for instance, this system gives its first sell signal in June 1996 and continues to say the same consistently right through to the market top at the turn of the century. So perhaps that's far-sighted. Then again from June 1996 to the end of the century equities outperformed bonds by 78%. There comes a point when 'right but really, really, early' equals wrong. As a wise man once said, and so it seems, valuation alone is never enough.



Figure 1. S&P 500 12-Month Forward P/E (Top), Buy/Sell Signals Based on 1.5 SD Bands (Middle), and Performance of These Signals (Bottom)

Source: Man DNA; as of 28 February 2023. All performance data from Bloomberg. Forward P/Es from IBES. US Equities are represented by the S&P 500. US Bonds are the Bloomberg Barclays US Treasury Aggregate. The P/E Conditioned portfolio goes to 100% equities when there is a BUY signal in the middle panel, to 100% bonds when there is a SELL signal, and otherwise defaults to the 50/50 portfolio. Please see the important information linked at the end of this document for additional information on hypothetical results.

Growth

ChatGPT: "If I had to choose only one metric to gauge economic activity in the US, I would choose the monthly nonfarm payrolls ('NFPs') report... The nonfarm payrolls report is closely watched by investors and economists as it provides insights into the health of the economy and the potential for future growth. A strong nonfarm payrolls report, indicating a large number of jobs added to the economy, can signal robust economic growth and could lead to higher stock prices...[and vice versa]."

In Figure 2 we perform a similar analysis as for Figure 1 but using the net change in NFPs as our signal, ChatGPT's chosen to metric to get a gauge on US economic activity and growth. As with the forward P/E, using this model in isolation does not seem to be performance enhancing.

500 300 100 -100 -300 -500 1958 1968 1978 1988 1998 2008 2018 -- +/- 1.0 SD (10Y Lookback) NFPs Monthly Chg 12MMA (k) 800 700 600 500 400 300 200 100 4 0 1968 1978 1958 1988 1998 2008 2018 US Equities vs US Bonds
 Buy Equities, Sell Bonds
 Sell Equities, Buy Bonds 14,000 12,000 CAGR: 7.8% 10.000 Vol · 8 0% Sharpe: 1.0 8.000 CAGR: 7.0% 6,000 Sharpe: 0.8 4,000 2,000 0 1958 1968 1978 1988 2008 2018 1998 - 50% Equity / 50% Bonds

Figure 2. NFPs Monthly Change (Top), Buy/Sell Signals Based on 1.0 SD Bands (Middle), and Performance of These Signals (Bottom)

Source: Man DNA; as of 28 February 2023. All data from Bloomberg. Asset performance indices and methodology the same as for Figure 1, with the exception that, per ChatGPT's recommendation, a move above +1 SD is BUY and vice versa. Please see the important information linked at the end of this document for additional information on hypothetical results.

NFPs Conditioned Portfolio

Sentiment

ChatGPT: "If you're only able to use one [sentiment] metric, which one you choose will depend on your investment objectives and risk tolerance. If you're more concerned with short-term price movements and potential market shocks, implied volatility may be more useful. If you're more focused on investor sentiment and the potential for longer-term trends in the stock market, equity fund flows may be a better choice...In general, it may be more attractive to buy equities when market sentiment is very negative, as this can lead to market oversold conditions...On the other hand, buying equities when market sentiment is very positive may be riskier, as the market may already be overbought and due for a correction."

Finally, we turn to sentiment. Here, try as we might, we couldn't squeeze a single answer out of the machine. Thus, in Figure 3, the top panel shows both VIX (implied volatility) as well as equity fund flows. Per ChatGPT's suggestion that optimistic market sentiment is potentially bearish, in terms of generating the buy and sell signals we flip the sign for the two metrics. Thus while a high VIX level (market pricing a lot of volatility) will equate to 'BUY', a high flow into US equity funds (indicating that investors perceive conditions to be benign) will equate to 'SELL'. Combining the two in this way (we simply take the average of the two z scores) yields the signals in the middle panel. The performance pattern is the same as for our first two indicators, namely, there's not much in it.

40 30 20 10 1993 1998 2003 2008 2013 2018 1999 2004 2009 2014 2019 US Eq. Fund Flows as % AUM VIX 3MMA --- +/- 1.0 SD (3Y Lookback) ---- +/- 1.0 SD (3Y Lookback) 200 150 100 50 0 г 1999 US Equities vs US Bonds Buy Equities, Sell Bonds Sell Equities, Buy Bonds 450 CAGR: 5.4% 400 350 Sharpe: 0.7 300 250 200 CAGR: 5.5% 150 Vol.: 10.4% 100 50 0 r 1999 2004 2009 2019

Figure 3. Sentiment Gauges (Top), Buy/Sell Signals Based on 1.0 SD Combination Bands (Middle), and Performance of These Signals (Bottom)

Source: Man DNA; as of 28 February 2023. All data from Bloomberg, except US fund flows which are derived from the EPFR dataset. Asset performance indices and methodology the same as for Figure 1, with the exception that, per ChatGPT's recommendation, a move above +1 SD is BUY and vice versa. Please see the important information linked at the end of this document for additional information on hypothetical results.

Sentiment Conditioned Portfolio

50% Equity / 50% Bonds

Conclusion

'Rubbish in, rubbish out' is one of the first lessons most financial analysts are taught. This being the case, it should come as no surprise that when we combine these signals we get pretty weak aggregate buy and sell recommendations, as is illustrated in Figure 4.

200 Mixed through the 2018 Terrible through the Covid recovery, completely missing the trade war, buying too early but then again at the trough strength of the bounce 150 Well-timed, albeit weak sell signal for the last Terrible around GFC: leg down of the buving into the crisis DotCom bust selling into the recovery Buying at 2022 troughs, the wisdom of which is still to be determined Well-timed, albeit weak, buy signal around the Eurozone crisis 0 1999 2014 2004 2009 2019 US Equities vs US Bonds
 Buy Equities, Sell Bonds Sell Equities, Buy Bonds

Figure 4. Aggregate of Signals Coming out of Figures 1-3, with Performance of Equities vs Bonds

Source: Man DNA; as of 28 February 2023 Please see the important information linked at the end of this document for additional information on hypothetical results.

Now, far be it from us to be a Luddite smashing looms. Indeed, we think it is more than likely that Al systems like ChatGPT may have significant utility for investment managers in many areas of information gathering and processing. In fact, we would go further; we think they could well become as vital an analytical tool as Google Search did two decades earlier. But in the same way, our view is that its value will not be in telling you when and in what to invest, but rather to give you more information, more quickly, so as to make better (human) decisions.

So this missive is not an attack on ChatGPT, but a comment on the innate limitations of heuristics within investment management. It is so tempting to believe in a quantitatively clean answer; this valuation metric, this DCF methodology, etc. But our view is that, like the philosopher's stone, while many will seek it, they shall all die doing so. Ours is not a game of Go or even something more complex; but one where the number of parameters is unknown, and their strength is ephemeral. A game which, therefore, requires an appreciation of shades of grey. So, for the time being at least, we believe our jobs as human investors – albeit ones heavily supported by machines – are safe. Then again, we say that with a good deal of humility. Many in history, when faced with the white heat of technology, have believed themselves to be walking a bright road ahead. When in fact it became, for them, a plank.

Author

Henry Neville, CFA

Portfolio Manager, Man Solutions



Henry Neville is a multi-asset portfolio manager at Man Solutions. Prior to joining Man Group in 2016, Henry completed the graduate program at Hoares Bank. Henry writes The Road Ahead, a regular series of macroeconomic commentary, published on Man Institute. He is also the co-author *The Best Strategies for Inflationary*

Times, winner of the prestigious 2022 Bernstein Fabozzi/Jacobs Levy Best Article Award. Henry studied History and Economics at St. Andrew's University. He is also a CFA charterholder.

Hypothetical Results

Hypothetical Results are calculated in hindsight, invariably show positive rates of return, and are subject to various modelling assumptions, statistical variances and interpretational differences. No representation is made as to the reasonableness or accuracy of the calculations or assumptions made or that all assumptions used in achieving the results have been utilized equally or appropriately, or that other assumptions should not have been used or would have been more accurate or representative. Changes in the assumptions would have a material impact on the Hypothetical Results and other statistical information based on the Hypothetical Results.

The Hypothetical Results have other inherent limitations, some of which are described below. They do not involve financial risk or reflect actual trading by an Investment Product, and therefore do not reflect the impact that economic and market factors, including concentration, lack of liquidity or market disruptions, regulatory (including tax) and other conditions then in existence may have on investment decisions for an Investment Product. In addition, the ability to withstand losses or to adhere to a particular trading program in spite of trading losses are material points which can also adversely affect actual trading results. Since trades have not actually been executed, Hypothetical Results may have under or over compensated for the impact, if any, of certain market factors. There are frequently sharp differences between the Hypothetical Results and the actual results of an Investment Product. No assurance can be given that market, economic or other factors may not cause the Investment Manager to make modifications to the strategies over time. There also may be a material difference between the amount of an Investment Product's assets at any time and the amount of the assets assumed in the Hypothetical Results, which difference may have an impact on the management of an Investment Product. Hypothetical Results should not be relied on, and the results presented in no way reflect skill of the investment manager. A decision to invest in an Investment Product should not be based on the Hypothetical Results.

No representation is made that an Investment Product's performance would have been the same as the Hypothetical Results had an Investment Product been in existence during such time or that such investment strategy will be maintained substantially the same in the future; the Investment Manager may choose to implement changes to the strategies, make different investments or have an Investment Product invest in other investments not reflected in the Hypothetical Results or vice versa. To the extent there are any material differences between the Investment Manager's management of an Investment Product and the investment strategy as reflected in the Hypothetical Results, the Hypothetical Results will no longer be as representative, and their illustration value will decrease substantially. No representation is made that an Investment Product will or is likely to achieve its objectives or results comparable to those shown, including the Hypothetical Results, or will make any profit or will be able to avoid incurring substantial losses. Past performance is not indicative of future results and simulated results in no way reflect upon the manager's skill or ability.

Important Information

This information is communicated and/or distributed by the relevant Man entity identified below (collectively the 'Company') subject to the following conditions and restriction in their respective jurisdictions.

Opinions expressed are those of the author and may not be shared by all personnel of Man Group plc ('Man'). These opinions are subject to change without notice, are for information purposes only and do not constitute an offer or invitation to make an investment in any financial instrument or in any product to which the Company and/or its affiliates provides investment advisory or any other financial services. Any organisations, financial instrument or products described in this material are mentioned for reference purposes only which should not be considered a recommendation for their purchase or sale. Neither the Company nor the authors shall be liable to any person for any action taken on the basis of the information provided. Some statements contained in this material concerning goals, strategies, outlook or other non-historical matters may be forward-looking statements and are based on current indicators and expectations. These forward-looking statements speak only as of the date on which they are made, and the Company undertakes no obligation to update or revise any forward-looking statements. These forward-looking statements are subject to risks and uncertainties that may cause actual results to differ materially from those contained in the statements. The Company and/or its affiliates may or may not have a position in any financial instrument mentioned and may or may not be actively trading in any such securities. Past performance is not indicative of future results.

Unless stated otherwise this information is communicated by the relevant entity listed below.

Australia: To the extent this material is distributed in Australia it is communicated by Man Investments Australia Limited ABN 47 002 747 480 AFSL 240581, which is regulated by the Australian Securities & Investments Commission (ASIC). This information has been prepared without taking into account anyone's objectives, financial situation or needs.

Austria/Germany/Liechtenstein: To the extent this material is distributed in Austria, Germany and/or Liechtenstein it is communicated by Man (Europe) AG, which is authorised and regulated by the Liechtenstein Financial Market Authority (FMA). Man (Europe) AG is registered in the Principality of Liechtenstein no. FL-0002.420.371-2. Man (Europe) AG is an associated participant in the investor compensation scheme, which is operated by the Deposit Guarantee and Investor Compensation Foundation PCC (FL-0002.039.614-1) and corresponds with EU law. Further information is available on the Foundation's website under www.eas-liechtenstein.li. This material is of a promotional nature.

European Economic Area: Unless indicated otherwise this material is communicated in the European Economic Area by Man Asset Management (Ireland) Limited ('MAMIL') which is registered in Ireland under company number 250493 and has its registered office at 70 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Grand Canal Dock, Dublin 2, Ireland. MAMIL is authorised and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland under number C22513.

Hong Kong SAR: To the extent this material is distributed in Hong Kong SAR, this material is communicated by Man Investments (Hong Kong) Limited and has not been reviewed by the Securities and Futures Commission in Hong Kong. This material can only be communicated to intermediaries, and professional clients who are within one of the professional investors exemptions contained in the Securities and Futures Ordinance and must not be relied upon by any other person(s).

Japan: To the extent this material is distributed in Japan it is communicated by Man Group Japan Limited, Financial Instruments Business Operator, Director of Kanto Local Finance Bureau (Financial instruments firms) No. 624 for the purpose of providing information on investment strategies, investment services, etc. provided by Man Group, and is not a disclosure document based on laws and regulations. This material can only be communicated only to professional investors (i.e. specific investors or institutional investors as defined under Financial Instruments Exchange Law) who may have sufficient knowledge and experience of related risks.

Switzerland: To the extent the material is distributed in Switzerland the communicating entity is: To the extent the material is made available in Switzerland the communicating entity is:

- For Clients (as such term is defined in the Swiss Financial Services Act): Man Investments (CH) AG, Huobstrasse 3, 8808 Pfäffikon SZ, Switzerland.
 Man Investment (CH) AG is regulated by the Swiss Financial Market Supervisory Authority ('FINMA'); and
- For Financial Service Providers (as defined in Art. 3 d. of FINSA, which are not Clients): Man Investments AG, Huobstrasse 3, 8808 Pfäffikon SZ, Switzerland, which is regulated by FINMA.

United Kingdom: Unless indicated otherwise this material is communicated in the United Kingdom by Man Solutions Limited ('MSL') which is an investment company as defined in section 833 of the Companies Act 2006. MSL is registered in England and Wales under number 3385362 and has its registered office at Riverbank House, 2 Swan Lane, London, EC4R 3AD, United Kingdom. MSL is authorised and regulated by the UK Financial Conduct Authority (the 'FCA') under number 185637.

United States: To the extent this material is distributed in the United States, it is communicated and distributed by Man Investments, Inc. ('Man Investments'). Man Investments is registered as a broker-dealer with the SEC and is a member of the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority ('FINRA'). Man Investments is also a member of the Securities Investor Protection Corporation ('SIPC'). Man Investments is a wholly owned subsidiary of Man Group plc. The registration and memberships described above in no way imply a certain level of skill or expertise or that the SEC, FINRA or the SIPC have endorsed Man Investments. Man Investments, 452 Fifth Avenue, 27th fl., New York, NY 10018.

This material is proprietary information and may not be reproduced or otherwise disseminated in whole or in part without prior written consent. Any data services and information available from public sources used in the creation of this material are believed to be reliable. However accuracy is not warranted or guaranteed. ©Man 2023.

MKT007203/S/GL/W/070324